Agenda Date: 4/26/06 Agenda Item: VII B



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, NJ 07102 www.bpu.state.nj.us

Customer Assistance

IN THE MATTER OF MAX NATURAL FOOD ET AL., PETITIONER v. PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC AND GAS COMPANY, RESPONDENT

ORDER ADOPTING INITIAL DECISION

BPU Docket No. EC05040339U OAL Docket No. PUC 7395-05

(SERVICE LIST ATTACHED)

)

BY THE BOARD:

On April 11, 2005, Max Natural Food, et al. (Petitioners) filed a petition with the Board of Public Utilities (Board) for a hearing in regard to a billing dispute with Public Service Electric and Gas Company (PSE&G) (Respondent).

On June 16, 2006, the Board transmitted this matter to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) for determination and initial disposition as a contested case pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:14B-1 et seq. and N.J.S.A. 52:14F-1 et seq. The matter was assigned to Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) Thomas E. Clancy.

During the pendency of this matter at the OAL, the Superior Court directed that two cases originally filed in that venue, regarding claims for damages, be dismissed and re-filed with the Board: Max Natural Food Wholesale, Inc. v. Public Service Electric and Gas Company, Docket No. ESK-L-003054-04, and Liu Xu, a/k/a Xu Liu v. Public Service Electric and Gas Company, Docket No. ESK-L-797-06. During settlement negotiations to resolve the within matter, ALJ Clancy also allowed the parties to negotiate settlement of the cases originally filed in Superior Court.

The parties engaged in negotiations and entered into a Settlement Agreement and General Release, providing for a release of claims in the within matter as well as in the cases originally filed in Superior Court. Under the terms of the settlement, <u>inter alia</u>, Petitioners release all of their claims against PSE&G, and PSE&G will pay Petitioners the amount of \$25,000.00. The settlement was submitted to the ALJ for review. On March 16, 2006, ALJ Clancy filed an Initial Decision with the Board, memorializing the terms of the settlement and recommending that it be

approved. The ALJ found the settlement to be voluntary, consistent with the law and fully dispositive of all issues in controversy. The ALJ therefore concluded that the settlement met the requirements of N.J.A.C. 1:1-19.1.

After review, the Board FINDS that the parties appear to have reached resolution of their differences, and the Board has been informed that PSE&G has made the payment provided for in the settlement agreement. The Board <u>HEREBY ADOPTS</u> the Initial Decision to the extent that the Petitioners withdraw their request for a hearing. The Board makes no finding as to any claims for damages raised by Petitioner and, in issuing this Order, is not ruling upon the reasonableness of the payment by PSE&G. The Board notes that it usually does not exercise jurisdiction as to damages. See Rosenblatt'v. New Jersey Natural Gas Company, BPU Dkt. No GC03070523U (July 20, 2005); Catino v. MCI Metro Access Transmission Services, LLC, dba MCI Telecommunications, BPU Dkt. No. TC03050386U (July 23, 2004); I/M/O Petition of David and Elizabeth Nikel v. Public Service Electric & Gas Co., BPU Dkt. No. EC02040250 (Nov. 19. 2002); Muise v. GPU, Inc., 332 N.J. Super. 140, 163 (App. Div. 2000); Boldt v. Correspondence Management, Inc., 320 N.J. Super. 74, 87 (App. Div. 1999); Slowinski v. Public Service Electric and Gas Co., BPU Dkt. No. EC96090688U, OAL Dkt. No. PUC 10082-96 (June 11, 1997); Slowinski v. Public Service Electric and Gas Co., BPU Dkt. No. EC91111716U, OAL Dkt. No. PUC 305-92 (May 21, 1993); Hess v. New Jersey Central Power & Light Co., Dkt. No. OC8611-1198 (Mar. 3, 1987); Aguilante v. New Jersey Nat. Gas Co., BPU Dkt No. 845-256 (Nov. 7, 1984). As in prior cases, the Board will not exercise jurisdiction over damages in this matter.

Therefore, to the extent discussed above, the Board HEREBY ADOPTS the Initial Decision and to the extent that it may be construed as a ruling upon damages and/or the payment by PSE&G, the Board HEREBY MODIFIES the Initial Decision.

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

JEANNE M. FOX PRESIDENT

FREDERICK F, BUTLER

COMMISSIONER

CONNIE O. HUGHES COMMISSIONER

CHRISTINE V. BATOF COMMISSIONER

JOSEPH L. FÍORDALISO COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

EBY CERTIFY that the within KRISTI IZZ document is a true copy of the original

SECRETARY the files of the Board of Public

Utilities

BPU Docket No. EC05040339U OAL Dkt. No. PUC 7395-05

Max Natural Food, et al. v. Public Service Electric and Gas Company

BPU Docket No. EC05040339U OAL Dkt. No. PUC 7395-05

SERVICE LIST

Kevin K. Tung, Esq. Kevin Kerveng Tung, P.C 1744 Highway 27 Edison, NJ 08817

Jason A. Lewis, Esq.²
Public Service Electric and Gas Co.
80 Park Plaza – T5G
Newark, NJ 07102

Kent Papsun, Director Division of Customer Assistance Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, NJ 07102

Jeff Slutzky, Esq. Division of Law 124 Halsey St. - 5th Floor Newark, NJ 07102



State of New Jersey OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

LNIS BESLUA ZPA

SL TERIO Y

STARK

INITIAL DECISION

SETTLEMENT

OAL DKT. NO. PUC 07395-05

AGENCY DKT. NO. EC05040339U

MAX NATURAL FOOD ET AL.

Petitioner.

V

PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC AND GAS COMPANY,

Respondent.

Kevin K. Tung, Esq., for petitioner (Kevin Kerveng Tung, P.C

Thomas P. Thackston, Esq. for respondent

Record Closed March 13, 2006

Decided March 16, 2006

BEFORE THOMAS E. CLANCY, ALAJ

This matter was transmitted to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) on June 23, 2006, for resolution as a contested case pursuant to *N.J.S.A.* 52:14B- to -15 and *N.J.S.A.* 52:14F1 to -13.

During the pendency of the case at the Office of Administrative Law, the parties settled their differences as provided in the attached Settlement Agreement and General Release.

da

Having reviewed the contents of the attached Settlement Agreement and General Release FIND: (a) that they are consistent with the law 'b) that they dispose of all issues in controversy, and (c) that they were voluntarily entered into by the parties

Accordingly CONCLUDE that the attached Settlement Agreement and General Release meets the requirements of *N.J.A.C.* 1-19.1(d) and hereby **APPROVE** same In conjunction therewith, I **ORDER** that the parties comply with its contents and that these proceedings be (and are hereby) **TERMINATED**.

hereby FILE my initial decision with the **BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES** for consideration

This recommended decision may be adopted, modified or rejected by the **BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES**, which by law is authorized to make a final decision in this matter. If the Board of Public Utilities does not adopt, modify or reject this decision within forty-five (45) days and unless such time limit is otherwise extended this recommended decision shall become a final decision in accordance with <u>N.J.S.A</u> 52:14B-10

3/16/06	Thomas & Clany
DATE /	THOMAS E. CLANCY, ALAJ
	Receipt Acknowledged
DATE	BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES
	Mailed to Parties
DATE	OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

AND

GENGRAL RELEASE

(OAL DKt. # 7395-05

THIS GENERAL RELEASE MADE MIS 13 M DRY OF

AND Softliment Agreement

MARCH, 2006 BETWEEN

MAX NATURA FOOD WHOUSAUE, INC. NO XU LIU, (HERLINAFISE RESEARED DO M"RELENSORS"),

در سمامر

PUBLIC STRVICT ELECTRIC NO GAS COMPANY (HEREMATTINE PATRICES TO AS "REASER").

1. REMASONS BINE UP AND RELEASE AT MY ALL CLAMS

AND RIGHTE THEY MAY HAVE AGAINST RELEASED. THIS

PALLASS ML CLAMS, INCLUDED MOSE OF LAHICH REMAINS ALE

NOT AWARE AND THOSE NOT HENTOND IN THIS PALLASE. THE

PALLASS APPLIES TO CLAMS PASSITIAND FAVOR ANT THAT ENLAGE.

HAS HAPPYED UP WHIL NOW. ** I STECHEDAY PALLASE THE

FOLLOWING CLAMS: ALL CLAMS IN THE MATTERS MAY NATURAL

FOOD (NHOUSENG, Inc. v. PUBLIC SERVICE EXECUTION OF GAS COMMENT)

DOCKED NO. ESK-L-COBOSY-OY: LIV XV alkla XV LIV V

PUBLIC SERVICE EXECUTION AND GAS COMMENT, DOCKED NO. ESK-L
797-06: AND MAX NATURA FOOD VS. PSEEL, OAL DOCKET

NO. PUC-07395-05.

I HAVE STEN PAD A TOTAL OF TWENTY FIVE THOUSAND

(#25,000.00) DOLLARS IN FULL PRYMENT FOR MISSEME THIS

PHLEASTE. PENEASONS AGENT THAT THEY WILLNOT

SAIK MY THING FORTHER, IN CLUDING MY OTHER DAYMONTS

FROM PERLEASER.

3. REMEASONS AND JOINTRY AD SEVENTILY BUND BY
THE RIGHTS OF RESEASONS. THIS PRUSHER IS MADE

FOR MY BENGTOF PERSONS AND FOR ALL WHO SUCCESS THE RIGHTS AND POSISESSIBILITIES OF THE PERSONS.

4 Dresson (W-MACOA	A AS ASUK PO THE HUMI OF
THIS GENERAL PORTESS.	WITH MSPECT NO THE CONTENTS
DEAGAGON ITT PROPER	Conforted OFFICE / SMITTENION
TO SIGN THE SANG AND,	Has son & so. on scholf of
MAX FOODS	MAR MARINE FOOD WHOUSENS, INC.
RY	. Manual Manual
1/1/1/1/14	owner.
ATMIT	
	XU LIU A/P/A LIU XU
- Mers H	
III	
J. A.S.	· Alphi
### ### AS	Thomas & Thacks low
Litress	Thomas & Thanks low Altorney Bor PS = 4 G
Lidness	Thomas & Thacks low Attacher Br PSE & G
Lidges	어제 하는 사람들이 살아야 하 다는 것이 되었다. 그는 사람들이 다른 사람들이 되었다면 보다 다른 사람들이 되었다면 다른 사람들이 되었다. 그는 사람들이 되었다면 다른
Littless Cotitioners (MAX F	어제 하는 사람들이 살아야 하 다는 것이 되었다. 그는 사람들이 다른 사람들이 되었다면 보다 다른 사람들이 되었다면 다른 사람들이 되었다. 그는 사람들이 되었다면 다른
5. Potitioners (MAX F with drew their o	PSE & G
5. Petitioners (MAX F with draw their of hearing in case	PSE & G
5. Potitioners (MAX f with draw their of hearing in case # MC 7395	PSE & G
5. Petitioners (MAX F with draw their of hearing in case	PSE & G



State of New Jersey OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW 33 Washington Street Newark, New Jersey 07102 (973) 648-6008

NORTH

	Date: MAR 2 0 2006
Re: Initial Decisions for Receipt	
Receipt of the following deci of this form) is acknowledged as of	sions from the Office of Administrative Law (as well as a copy of the date indicated below:
OAL Docket No. PUC	Case Name
7395-05	MAX NATURAL FOOD ETAL
	Board of Public Utilities
	2 Gateway Center
	Newark, New Jersey 07102
Note: And	\mathcal{J}

Board of Public Utilities